

Translating the Qur'an in Indonesia: Marrying the Concept of Transcreation and Critical Discourse Analysis

Fahmi Gunawan¹, Batmang², Saad Boulahnane³

¹ Institut Agama Islam Negeri Kendari. e-mail: fgunawan@iainkendari.ac.id

² Institut Agama Islam Negeri Kendari. e-mail: batmangiainkdi@gmail.com

³ Department of English Studies & translation, Hassan I University, Settat, Morocco. e-mails.boulahnane@aui.ma

ARTICLE INFO	ABSTRACT
Keywords: Critical Discourse Analysis; Indonesia; Religious Sacred Text; Transcreation; Translation Studies DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.21093/ijeltal.v8i2.1523 How to cite: Gunawan, F. Batmang, B., & Boulahnane, S. (2023). Translating the Qur'an in Indonesia: Marrying the Concept of Transcreation and Critical Discourse Analysis. <i>Indonesian Journal of English Language Teaching and Applied Linguistics</i>, 8(2), 117-131	Despite the growing concerns of research discussing transcreation in translation studies from various perspectives, little empirical evidence reported the transcreation in Quranic translation as a religious sacred text. To fill this void, the present study aims to elucidate Qur'an translation in Indonesia from the perspective of transcreation and critical discourse analysis. The data were collected via observation of translations of Quranic verses which contain transcreation. The findings suggest that Quranic translation as a religious sacred text encompasses extensive transcreation. It took the form of words, phrases, and clauses—units used to create a discourse in upholding Islamic law and exclusivism in Indonesia. The discourse of Sharia law enforcement was attributed to situational, institutional, and social factors. This empirical study implies that transcreation in the sacred text is unavoidable due to the translators' ideology and socio-cultural background differences and creates a metanarrative on the importance of mutual respect, tolerance, and interfaith dialogue.

1. Introduction

Transcreation concepts in translation studies have received enormous attention from translation experts around the globe over the last decades. They discussed the concept of transcreation from various perspectives (Gambier, 2016; Katan, 2016; Munday & Gambier, 2014). Munday & Gambier (2014) maintained that transcreation is a creative process, especially in translating marketing and advertisement texts (Pedersen, 2017). Katan (2019) and Spinzi and Rizzo (2019) pointed out that translators use transcreation in translation studies to create a target text that appears locally. This can be achieved by leaving the reader alone and bringing the text to them by opting for specific and creative language, thereby

domesticating it. In research in-game visuals, transcreation refers to the local visual game to ensure the text cannot be interpreted freely. Likewise, in religious text research, such as Qur'an translation, transcreation refers to the translator's independent interpretations to interpret the Qur'anic verses based on their ideologies, life experiences, and backgrounds.

Research on transcreation in translation studies has been undertaken by many researchers and analyzed from several perspectives. First, it was found in the literature texts (see Benetello, 2018; Gaballo, 2012; Kwiatek, 2020). The concept was used to translate classic drama from Indian Sanskrit to English and later developed into poetry by H. De Campos in Brazil (Gaballo, 2012). Second, it was modified and developed in the translation of the computer game (O'Hagan, 2012; O'Hagan & Chandler, 2016; Šiaučiūnė & Liubinienė, 2011). However, the concept of transcreation in video games was refuted by Bernal-Merino (2014), who stated that there is an inconsistency in the transcreation concept in computer games. Third, it was applied in research related to the field of fish businesses (Al-Omar, 2020; Risku et al., 2017; Rodríguez, Olvera-Lobo & Moya-Molina, 2020) and marketing (Mavis Ho, 2020; Gaspari et al., 2015). In those fields, advertising and marketing were created based on consumers' targets by putting forward local tastes to increase the purchasing of the advertised products. These three forms of evidence signify that the study of transcreation is interrelated to literary texts, localization games texts, marketing, and advertisement texts. Hence, little is known about Qur'an translation as religious texts using the concept of transcreation. Interestingly, contemporary Arabic experts have positioned the Qur'an as a literary text that should be deeply analyzed (Abu Zaid, 1991; Al-Khuli, 1991; Kermani, 2004).

Meanwhile, studies of the Qur'an translation from the concepts of transcreation and critical discourse analysis are under-researched. Most of the existing research examines the relationship between Qur'an translation and critical discourse analysis with certain topics such as discourse markers (Mohamed, 2017), ideological attitudes of editors and translators (van der Deijl, 2022), male-female collaborative translation (Haroun, 2022), stylistic variations (Qassem, 2021), multi-emotive irony (Abuisaac et al., 2021), and barriers of intercultural communication (Abuisaac et al., 2023).

To fill this void,, the present study explores the transcreation of Muhammad Thalib's Qur'an translation text from the perspective of critical discourse analysis. This study should be conducted for the target readers to fully comprehend the text anchored in the translator's social-cultural background. Accordingly, this creates a scenario where one region has a different Qur'an translation from the other. This is when the translator resorts to transcreation while translating the text.

With this in mind, two questions are addressed in this study:

- 1) What is the form of transcreation offered by Muhammad Thalib in his translation of Qur'an into Indonesian?
- 2) Why do transcreation forms exist?

The answers to these two questions might contribute both conceptually and empirically. This study attempts to conceptually merge the concepts of transcreation and critical discourse analysis by analyzing a translation of the Qur'an. Therefore, it is possible to analyze translations of other texts using the combination of these two concepts. Empirically, this research contributes to the body of knowledge in providing critical awareness to readers that transcreation occurs not only in literary works, games, marketing, advertising, and business

but also in the holy Qur'an. This is due to the translator's ideology, sociocultural, and religious upbringing.

2. Literature Review

This present study adopts the concept of transcreation by Rike (2013) and critical discourse analysis by Fairclough (1992). The first concept is employed to analyze data on Al-Qur'an translations that contain transcreation, while the second concept is adopted to elucidate why the transcreation is used in the Qur'an translation. The last ten years have seen a rise in the popularity of the term "transcreation" in the language services industry. Benetello (2018) argued that 'transcreation' is a translation-derived activity defined by an interlingual creative re-interpretation of a text taking into account that the target audience is different from the audience originally intended. O'Hagan (2012) revealed that transcreation involves both a cultural adaption and language translation of the content. Because it has become increasingly common for businesses to adapt their marketing efforts to global markets in recent years, transcreation has played a role in marketing and advertising. Following to Rike (2013) that transcreation is linked to the notion of creativity. This original thought can be seen in an indicator that suggests that translators have complete freedom to change, omit, or add textual parts. To this end, the present study observes and analyzes the translations of Qur'anic verses carried out by specific translators with their own ideological objectives using the concept of transcreation, which is typically utilized in the sectors of marketing and advertising. As a result, this research is expected to broaden the operationalization of transcreation concept which focuses on the sacred book of a religion in addition to marketing, internet advertising, and game localization.

The concept of critical discourse analysis (CDA) is also utilised in this study in addition to the concept of transcreation. By employing critical discourse analysis, someone can learn to grasp language in the situation and cultural contexts. It turns out that language serves as more than just a tool for communication; it may also be employed to dismantle ideology, structures of power, injustice, social inequality, and abuse of authority. Following to Fairclough (1992), dismantling an ideology can be accomplished through the use of three stages: language analysis, interpretation analysis, and explanation analysis. In this study, language analysis concerns the use of the transcreation concept in the Qur'an translation, whereas interpretation analysis concerns the manner in which a translated text is understood. The use of the transcreation concept in the Qur'an translation is the subject of language analysis in this study, whilst the production, consumption, and distribution of translated texts are the subjects of interpretation analysis. Then, situational features, institutional aspects, and socio-cultural aspects are included in the explanatory analysis that was utilized to analyze the data. Therefore, it is expected that the use of transcreation concept and CDA will extend the reader's understanding of the existence of a transcreation strategy in the Qur'an translation and the elements influencing it.

3. Research Methodology

3.1 Research Design

In the present study, discourse analysis was used as a research design to examine samples of transcreation produced by Muhammad Thalib in his interpretive translation of Qur'an into Indonesian language as 'Al-Qur'anul Karim Tarjamah Tafsiriyyah'. This translation work is

offered as a sample because it reflects the individual viewpoint of the translator, who frequently has strong religious ideological motivations. Thus, the use of Fairclough's (1992) CDA concept is expected to reveal the religious ideology of the translator adopting different features of discourse, i.e., target and source text, discourse practice (interpretation), and sociocultural practice (explanation).

3.2 Participants

In collecting the data, we use sample data of Muhammad Talib's translation of the Qur'an which contains transcreation. The data was then brought into a focus group discussion (FGD) attended by five experts to determine the transcreation form in the translated text, and reveal discourse practice (interpretation) and sociocultural practice (explanation) as the context of the text. Due to their considerable authority in the Indonesian translation industry, they are hired with specific payment agreements like salary. This authority may be observed in their translations, which are widely used in Indonesia, as well as in their academic accomplishments and theoretical understanding of translation. This can be observed in the demographics of the participants as follows.

Table 1. Demographics of the participants

Pseudonames	Ages	gender	Roles
A	59	Male	Professor in translation studies
B	35	Male	Ph.D in translation studies, rater
C	45	Male	Ph.D in translation studies, rater
D	34	Male	Ph.D. in translation and Arabic studies
E	40	Male	Ph.D in translation and Arabic studies

The discussions among experts using the Indonesian language lasted for two days, starting from 08.00-15.00 Indonesian time (WIB) at Cold Bro Coffee, Surakarta, Indonesia. The first day of discussion was conducted by equalizing perceptions regarding the concept of transcreation and examples of its application in various kinds of texts such as advertising texts, political texts, and so on. Operationally, they discussed the extent to which the concept of transcreation was discussed by scholars, who were the originators and experts who applied it. The second day was carried out by conducting an investigation or analyzing the verses of the Qur'an that were sampled whether they included transcreation or not. Verses that are included in transcreation are selected, while verses that do not contain transcreation are omitted/sorted. After that, their interpretation and explanation of the verse is also carried out to make it easier for the writer to put it in written form. The discussion results were recorded using a Samsung Ultranote smartphone. The results were then transcribed and put in written form.

3.4 Data Analysis Procedures

The data analysis was conducted by adopting Fairclough's (1992) CDA as it is regarded as one of the the most comprehensive models available to identify samples of transcreation along with the ideological implications associated with them. To this end, the following steps were carried out:

- (1) determining whose Qur'an translation will utilized,

- (2) looking particularly to the verses contained transcreation,
- (3) determining which verses according to the use of transcreations,
- (4) determining the forms of transcreation in the verses, and
- (5) determining discourse practice (interpretation) and sociocultural practice (explanation) as the context of the text.

To provide a basis for accuracy in this analysis, triangulation has been used to ensure the validity of the findings. Hence, back translation was employed based on the Arabic dictionaries.

4. Findings

4.1. Linguistic units of Transcreation

Word transcreations

Word transcreation is a transcreation technique that not only transcribes the meaning of every single word, but may also add an overtone to the message based on the translator's creativity, productivity on his/her creativity, productivity and the flexibility that s/he has on the one hand, and target readers' interpreting frames activated by virtue of the overtone added. Word transcreation can be found in the word of *tahkīm* at the surah of Al-Māidah [25]: 44 and *Az-ẓālimīn* at the surah of Al-Baqarah [2]: 193.

In the *Lisān Al-'Arab* dictionary, the word *tahkīm* means to decide (Manzūr, 1955). This word has the same root with *hakim*, which means a person who decides the case. In the Quran, most of the words *tahkīm* are translated into Indonesian as *memutuskan* (to decide) as stated in surah Al-Maidah [5]: 44, surah Al-Maidah [5]: 45, and surah Al-Maidah [5]: 47. However, Thalib translated it differently—as *menetapkan* (to assign) and *melaksanakan* (to practice) the law based on Allah's sharia that was sent down to his prophets. The word *tahkim* got an additional clause as the aforementioned, which refers to some book commentaries, such as *Baḥr al-Ulūm* (As-Samarqandī, nd) and the translator's ideology (Thalib, 2012).

As regards the word *az-Ẓālimīn*, in the *Lisān Al-'Arab* dictionary it means *orang zalim* (a despotic) or a person who commits acts of abuse that harms oneself and other people. This word has been included in the Indonesian dictionary, which means violent, merciless, unjust, and cruel (Sunendar et al, 2015). However, in the translation offered by Thalib, the denotative meaning of this word changed to refer to people who interfere with the implementation of the Shari'a (i.e., people who disturbed the implementation of sharia). This shift in meaning occurs due to the translator's accumulated value system, belief, assumption and background that motivate him to disseminate and enforce the Islamic law, thus superimposing certain directionality on the text at hand.

Phrase Transcreations

Akin to word transcreation, phrase transcreation is a transcreation technique opted for by the translator based on their creativity, productivity the flexibility that s/he has on the one hand, and the target reader's interpreting frame activated the effect of the overtone added on the other. Phrase transcreation can be found at the phrase *ṣirāṭ mustaqīm* in surah Yasin [36]: 61, and at the phrase *ulil amri* in surah Al-Nisā [4]: 59, as shown in the following example:

Example 1: Yasin, [36]: 61

وَأَنِ اعْبُدُونِي ۚ هَذَا صِرَاطٌ مُسْتَقِيمٌ
wa ani'budūnī hāzā širāṭ mustaqīm

Back translation	Dan hendaklah kamu menyembah-Ku. Inilah <u>jalan yang lurus.</u> <i>And that you worship only Me, this is the straight path.</i>
Thalib's translation	Seharusnya kaliaan taat dan tunduk kepada-Ku. <u>Islam adalah agama-Ku yang benar.</u> <i>You should obey and subject to only Me, Islam is my truthful religion.</i>

This example illustrates the translation differences between **صِرَاطٌ مُسْتَقِيمٌ** (*širāṭ mustaqīm*) in the back translation and Thalib's translation. In the back translation, as can be observed, the phrase was translated into Indonesian as *jalan yang lurus* (i.e. the straight path) while in the translation offered by Thalib, he opted for *Islam adalah agama-Ku yang benar* (i.e. Islam is my truthful religion), thus reflecting his ideology in the text. Lexically, the word *širāṭ* means *jalan (path)* (Manzūr, 1955). However, etymologically, its origin means *menelan (to swallow)*. Its etymological background considers *the path* so wide that it seems *to swallow* anyone who passed through it (Manzūr, 1955). Whenever this word is attached to something, the attachment can be traced back to Allah as in the phrase *širāṭaka* (jalan-Mu/Your-path), *širāṭi* (jalan-Ku/My-path), and to those believers whom the grace of God was bestowed upon as shown in the following phrase *širāṭ al-laẓīna an'amta 'alaihim* (i.e. jalan orang-orang yang Engkau beri kenikmatan/the path of those upon whom You have bestowed favor).

With respect to the word *mustaqīm*, it means *lurus* (i.e. straight). However, the combination of *širāṭ mustaqīm* means 'jalan lebar yang dilalui seseorang untuk mencapai tujuannya' (i.e. a straight wide path one takes to achieve his or her goals). This straight wide path is the only way that points toward a true happiness in this world and the afterworld. Al-Ṭabarī (2000) comments that this straight wide path is the only religion accepted by Allah. This idea is supported by Al-Dāmagānī (1980), who asserts that the word *širāṭ* means the Religion of Allah, which includes every Abrahamic religion, not only Islam. As such, this religion has been tasked to every prophet from Adam, Ibrahim (Abraham), Musa (Moses), Isa (Jesus), to Muhammad—peace be upon them. Contextually, this verse ordered all human beings to obey and subject to only Allah by fulfilling all His commands, avoiding any prohibition, and ignoring Satan's tricks and persuasions. If a servant of Allah fulfills these commands and avoids prohibition, they will walk on the blessed path based on the truthful religion that worships Allah (Kašīr, 1999).

Thalib, as one may notice, translated the phrase **صِرَاطٌ مُسْتَقِيمٌ** *širāṭ mustaqīm* into Indonesian as *Islam adalah agama-Ku yang benar* (i.e. Islam is my truthful religion), thereby superimposing certain directionality on the text with ideological implications that could be consistent with his accumulated value system, assumption, belief, background and commitment, but lacked the contextual background presented within the verse as stated above. To put this differently, Thalib allowed his ideological preferences to interpose into his work, thus regarding Islam as the only truthful religion accepted by Allah and, accordingly, other religions deserve no recognition. As such, the translation offered by Thalib can be considered as a more open interpretation to the phrase *širāṭ mustaqīm* " as acclaimed by some

commentators of the Qur'an such as Al-Samarqandī (n.d.), rather than a translation to the phrase.

Example 2: An-Nisa, [4]: 59

يَا أَيُّهَا الَّذِينَ آمَنُوا أَطِيعُوا اللَّهَ وَأَطِيعُوا الرَّسُولَ وَأُولِيَ الْأَمْرِ مِنْكُمْ
 ya ayyuha al-lazīna āmanū aṭīullāh wa aṭīurrasūla wa ulil amri minkum

Back translation	Wahai orang-orang yang beriman! Taatilah Allah dan taatilah Rasul (Muhammad), dan <u>Ulil Amri (pemegang kekuasaan) di antara kamu.</u> O you who have believed, obey Allah and obey the Messenger (Muhammad) and <u>those in authority among you.</u>
Thalib's translation	Wahai kaum mukmin, taatlah kalian kepada Allah dan taatlah kepada Rasul-Nya, serta <u>para pemimpin yang menegakkan syariat Islam dari golongan kalian.</u> O believers, you must obey Allah and obey His Messenger, and <u>the rulers who practice Islamic laws among you.</u>

Transcreation in example (2) was in phrase أُولِيَ الْأَمْرِ (*ulī al-amri*). In the back translation, the phrase أُولِيَ الْأَمْرِ *ulī al-amri* was translated as *pemegang kekuasaan* (i.e. those in authority) while in the translation offered by Thalib was translated into *para pemimpin yang menegakkan syariat Islam* (i.e. the rulers who practice Islamic laws). Lexically, the word أُولِيَ *ulī* is a plural form of the word وَلِي *waliy*, which etymologically means *pemilik* (i.e. the owner), *yang mengurus* (i.e. the administrator), or *menguasai* (i.e. the one who takes control over everything) (Manzūr, 1955). This plural form refers to more people and the word الْأَمْرِ *al-Amr* means *perintah* (i.e. command) or *urusan* (i.e. affairs) (Manzūr, 1955). As such, the phrase *ulī al-amr* refers to anyone who gains authority over every affair among the Muslim communities. They gain trust from their community to administer social affairs and take no stand in theological neither religious matters (Shihab, 2005). Some commentators state that they are the rulers or the government (Al-Tabarī, 2000) while some other commentators hold that they are scholars in religious fields (Al-Qurtubī, 1964). However, some other commentators argue they are the ones who represent the public from various communities and professions (Riḍā, 1990).

The contextual background behind the verse is about a band of the Prophet's fellows led by Abdullah bin Hudzaifah bin Qais, who sent on an expedition to march with a troop without the presence of the Prophet. By that moment, the commanding officer of the troop ordered his subordinates to jump into the balefire as an amusement during the rest. Intending no more than to test and to joke around, the commanding officer ordered them to jump into the fire. Undoubtedly, the order was causing dissension. They then denounced that matter to The Prophet, who argued that in that case, the commanding officer did not make that order out of intention and there was no obedience to someone who ordered such badness or vileness (Al-Qurtubī, 1964; Riḍā, 1990; Al-Ṭabarī, 2000)

With this in mind, Thalib, in his translation, did not provide his readers with the textual meaning, nor did he provide the contextual meaning. Rather, he added the phrase *yang menegakkan syariat Islam* (i.e. who practice Islamic laws), thereby taking the text in a certain directionality that is in line with his desire motivated by his ideology to make the legitimate

ruler or the government establish the Islamic laws. Building on this, it can be said that the official translation, as opposed to Thalib's translation, provided the reader not only with the textual meaning, but the contextual one as well.

Clause Transcreations

Clause transcreation is a transcreation technique that not only translates the clause but also offers other translations based on the translation creation and target readers. The clause transcreation in this study can be found at the clause *anfiqū* in surah Yasin [36]: 61, Al-Baqarah [2]: 193 and 208 as can be seen in the following.

Example 3: Yasin, [36]: 47

وَإِذَا قِيلَ لَهُمْ أَنْفِقُوا مِمَّا رَزَقَكُمُ اللَّهُ
wa izā qīla lahum ***anfiqū*** mimmā razaqakumullah

Back translation	Dan apabila dikatakan kepada mereka, " <i>Infakkanlah</i> sebagian rezeki yang diberikan Allah kepadamu." <i>And when it is said to them, "<i>Give to a charity</i> from that which Allah has provided for you."</i>
Thalib's translation	Bila ada yang berkata kepada mereka: " <i>Dermakanlah untuk membela Islam</i> sebagian dari rezeki yang Allah karuniakan kepada kalian." <i>If it is said to them, "<i>Donate for the sake of defending Islam</i> from that which Allah has provided for you".</i>

Clause transcreations in example 3 can be found at the clause *أَنْفِقُوا* (*anfiqū*). Terminologically, the clause *أَنْفِقُوا* (*anfiqū*) means *berinfaklah di jalan Allah, memberi makan, dan mengeluarkan sedekah (give to a charity for the sake of God, feed, and make a donation)* (Manzūr, 1955). Scholars in the field of Quranic interpretations from the classical school such as Al-Ṭabarī (2000) and contemporary school such as Al-Ṣiddīqy (2000) were in agreement in translating the word *أَنْفِقُوا* (*anfiqū*) into *infakkanlah (give to a charity)*. This verse, contextually, discusses misdeeds by the Non-believers in Mecca who refused to help the poor from the Muslim communities. This verse, similarly to other related verses, illustrates the similar arguments proposed by Non-Believers of Quraish to defy the message from the Prophet who asked them to accept the Quran and to bear witness for one, true God that is Allah. The back translation maintained the word *أَنْفِقُوا* (*anfiqū*) to its textual and contextual meaning that is *infakkanlah (give to a charity)*.

On the contrary, Thalib chose to translate the clause into *berdermalah untuk membela Islam (donate for the sake of defending Islam)*. The word *berdermalah (donate)* in that clause was more acceptable, textually and contextually. However, the following phrase *untuk membela Islam (for the sake of defending Islam)* was considered the inherent meaning to the text. The big (Official) Dictionary of Indonesian Language defines the word *membela (defend)* as *memihak untuk melindungi dan mempertahankan (to take a side in order to protect and to defend)* (Sunendar et al, 2015). If the word *defend* were put before the word *Islam* in a clause, it would constitute the meaning of *choosing to protect and to defend Islam*. Thalib, insisting on the idea of defending Islam, allowed his ideological bias to interpose in his translation

work. This also affirmed his position as a commanding officer in The Assembly of Religious Defenders (*Majlis Mujahidin Indonesia*) with Islamic law establishment as its political agenda.

Example 4: Al-Baqarah [2]: 193

وَقَاتِلُوهُمْ حَتَّى لَا تَكُونَ فِتْنَةٌ وَيَكُونَ الدِّينُ لِلَّهِ فَإِنْ انْتَهَوْا فَلَا عُدْوَانَ إِلَّا عَلَى الظَّالِمِينَ
 Wa qātilūhum **hatta lā takūna fitnah** wa yakūna al-dīnu lillāh, **fa in intahau**, fa lā 'udwāna illā
 'alā al-zālimīn

Back translation	Dan perangilah mereka itu sampai tidak ada lagi fitnah, dan agama hanya bagi Allah semata. Jika mereka berhenti, maka tidak ada (lagi) permusuhan, kecuali terhadap orang-orang zalim. Fight them until there is no [more] fitnah and [until] worship is [acknowledged to be] for Allah. But if they cease, then there is to be no aggression except against the oppressors.
Thalib's translation	Wahai kaum Mukmin, perangilah musuh-musuh kalian sampai rintangan terhadap pelaksanaan Syariat Islam lenyap, dan manusia mengikuti agamanya semata-mata karena taat kepada Allah. Jika musuh-musuh kalian mau berhenti dari merintangi pelaksanaan syariat Islam, maka antara kalian dengan mereka tidak ada alasan untuk bermusuhan. Bermusuhan dibolehkan hanya terhadap orang-orang yang melakukan gangguan pelaksanaan syariat. O believers, fight your enemies until the obstacles to the implementation of the Islamic Shari'a disappear, and people follow their religion solely out of obedience to Allah. If your enemies are willing to stop obstructing the implementation of Islamic law, then between you and them there is no reason to be hostile. Hostility is allowed only against people who interfere with the implementation of sharia.

The transcreation of example four can be seen in the clause **حَتَّى لَا تَكُونَ فِتْنَةٌ** (*hatta lā takūna fitnah*) dan **فَإِنْ انْتَهَوْا** (*fa in intahau*). In *back translation* perspective, this clause is translated semantically. Lisan Al-Arab dictionary shows that the word *hatta* means *sampai (until)*. *La takuna* means *tidak ada lagi (no more)*, and *fitnah* means *fitnah (slander)*. Similarly, clause *fa in intahau* is translated based on dictionary. The word *fain* means *jika (if)*, *intahau* means *mereka berhenti (they stop)*. However, Muhammad Thalib translates the text more creatively. The clause *hatta lā takūna fitnah* is translated into *sampai rintangan terhadap pelaksanaan Syariat Islam lenyap (until the obstacles to the implementation of the Islamic Shari'a disappear.)* The clause *fain intahau* is translated *Jika musuh-musuh kalian mau berhenti dari merintangi pelaksanaan syariat Islam (If your enemies are willing to stop obstructing the implementation of Islamic law)*. The forms of translation, transcreated by Muhamamd Thalib besides following his ideology of life, are also adapted to the target readers—those who support the establishment of an Islamic state in Indonesia.

4.2. Why do the forms of transcreation exist?

This study found that the Quranic translation put forward by Muhammad Thalib adopts a few kinds of transcreation including words, phrases, and clause transcreations. The transcreations can be explained from practical discourse aspects and social-cultural conditions where the translation text was created.

Muhammad Thalib's translation of the Qur'an was riveting, productive, and creative, which is palpable in the result of his translation. His work is not only a response to the translation of the Qur'an carried out by the state, which has many mistakes in translation, but also a response to the issue of radicalism. Therefore, Muhammad Thalib did not revise the translation. He included practical discourses in the text. The discourses established by Thalib in his translation can be seen from the linguistic units of words, phrases, and clauses. This research found at least three discourses that Muhammad Thalib established in his translation, namely enforcement of Islamic, religion exclusivity and pluralism avoidance, and the relationship between religion and states.

The enforcement Islamic law discourses are apparent in the translation of Muhammad Thalib. Words, phrases, and clauses were created by him to embody the concept of Islamic caliphate. The linguistic units that he has created are *tahkim*, *az-zalimin*, *sirat mustakim*, *ulil amri*, *hatta la takuna fitnah*, *fain intahau*, many other examples. The enforcement of Islamic law voiced by Muhammad Thalib was caused by his dissatisfaction with the existing democratic system in Indonesia. He assumed that all life problems could be solved efficiently by Islamic laws.

The effects of the enforcement of Islamic law cause various problems, including religious exclusivities—views that other religions are in error and Kufr (disbelief). This ideology believes in no truth in other religions but only in their religions. This is clearly seen in the translation of phrases *ṣirāṭ mustaqīm*, which is translated as Islam is my truthful religion. This translation hints that Islam is the only true religion while other religions are in error and Kufr. This also means that this discourse is not only exclusive, but also rejects pluralism. This kind of translation is certainly based on the original commentary, which describes radicalism.

The discourses on the relation between religion and state are also eminently visible in the several examples given. The words *tahkim* and *ulil amri*, for instance, inflict the relation between religion and state in the context of Indonesian democracy. Experts have different perspectives on this context; some approve democracy, and others disapprove. The experts who admit democracy believe that the democratic system is in line with the principle of Islam because it is established on the principles of justice and equality that are in line with the universal Islamic values. Conversely, disapproving experts believe that democracy does not follow the Islamic principles because it was born from the western cultures, which perpetuates hunger, tyranny, ignorance, and chaos in the states of Africa, Latin America, and Asia and cannot uphold justice. In this context, Muhammad Thalib agrees with the second experts' opinion, which refuses democratic systems. Consequently, Muhammad Thalib offers the concept of the Islamic Sharia enforcement system because he considers that Islamic sharia can solve the problems of injustice, hunger, tyranny, stupidity, and chaos. This is because all the things mentioned are contained in the Al-Qur'an.

Muhammad Thalib's translation texts can be described through the socio-cultural factors such as situational, institutional, and social factors. Situational factors are related to the situation and the emergence of *terjemah*. This translation was created as a response to the

literal translation by the ministry of religion (*terjemah harfiyah*), which contains some errors that need revising. He stated that he found at least 3224 mistakes that appear in the translation put forth by the Ministry of religion. The translation errors not only emanate in the aspects of monotheism but also in the legal and economic aspects. Besides, interpretation translation (*terjemah tafsiriyah*) also responds to the translation of the ministry of religion, which contains radicalism.

Institutionally, Muhammad Thalib is a general leader of a citizenship organization, namely *Majlis Mujahidi Indonesia*. This organization has the vision to enforce the Islamic law as a whole in the life of mankind—individuals and families as well as the state and nation. To manifest his goals, *Majlis Mujahidin Indonesia* under the first commander Abu Bakar Baa'syir commits some kinds of radicalism attacks, such as Bali bombings. On the contrary, under Muhammad Thalib's leadership, the enforcement of the Islamic law is carried out in a softer way unlike his predecessors. He translated the Qur'an by including the organization's visions and missions in the Quranic translation text. Muhammad Thalib made the verses of the Qur'an a form of legitimacy for the Islamic shariah enforcement in Indonesia as the representation of Thalib's prominence. His prominence is to convince the readers that Islamic shariah enforcement claim is based on the Qur'an. Further, he also wants to ensure that the readers believe that the democratic system is infidel as it is not based on Islamic guidance. Besides, he claims that Islamic shariah enforcement is a political goal. At this point, Islamic shariah no longer has meaning as a men's tool to his God, but as Thalib's political agenda in order to have complete and total enforcement of Islamic law. The theological claim that Thalib conveyed through the numbers of verses has been manipulated as a political maneuver. The aim is to affirm and protect himself from the attack of the other party at once to attack those who opposed his claims.

Socially, after the 1998 reformation, almost all religious organizations, such as *Hizbut Tahrir Indonesia (HTI)*, *Front Pembela Islam (FPI)*, and *Majlis Mujahidin Indonesia (MMI)* came up as the responses to the state's absence in resolving state problems. Poverty, injustice, and corruption are rampant; these things cannot be solved by a democratic country. As a matter of fact, the organizations claim that Indonesia should change the ideology of democracy to Islamic shariah. The argument is that Islam has regulated all aspects of human life, not only issues of worship but also socio-cultural, environmental, and political issues.

5. Discussion

This study shows that Muhammad Thalib has enacted transcreation in translating the text of the Qur'an, which is called *Tarjamah Tafsiriyyah*. This is because the lexical options used to indicate the translator's creation is not the source of the text. The lexical option refers to the effort to construct Islamic Sharia enforcement discourse due to the encouragement of social, situation, and institutional factors. These facts show that the socio-cultural background, organizational religion, and translator's ideologies influence the lexical choices to establish discourses (Gunawan, 2022). Furthermore, the lexical options show that *terjemah tafsiriyah* of Muhammad Thalib tends to contest against the hegemony of the translation of the Indonesian government Qur'an text. With this in mind, the translated text does not only belong to the government, but can also be done by societies, which have competencies in the field of Qur'an and translation studies (Gunawan et al., 2022). Thus, the translation must also consider the target readers and the state ideology.

Empirically, our finding is in line with previous studies. For instance, Khosravi and Pourmohammadi (2016) showed that as Muslim translators, Saffarzadeh and Al-Hilali exerted their interpretations, patron's ideology, religious ideologies, or dominant ideologies on their translations in their countries. Haroun (2022) observed that the "gender-neutral" translation of the Qur'an represents a number of historical and ideological forces. The case of Helminski, for example, demonstrates how cultural and linguistic backgrounds, Sufi teachings, and feminist agendas lead to a radical reading of the Qur'ān in English. However, the study also reported that religious ideology could not always affect the translation of the Al-Qur'an text. It was proved by Arberry and Dawood's translations as Christian and Jewish Quranic translators, who did not include their ideologies in the text of the translation of the Al-Qur'an (Bayri, 2019). Additionally, Al-Khatib (2018) reported that the ideological views of translators might affect the meaning of the translated verses. In fact, many meanings in the original text have been lost and misinterpreted. In line with this research, Abdol-Raof (2005) also pointed out that translation creativity could be done as long as the translators follow the language and the cultural norms of the source language. Paraphrasing through domestications, transposition, and transcreations could become solutions, but all those can eliminate the distinctive religious character in the Qur'an discourse and eliminate the true meaning of the source text.

Anchored by the study's findings, implications are twofold: first, from the empirical perspective, the translators who have applied transcreation in translating Quranic texts did mistranslation, eliminated the true meanings, and eliminated the religious character in the Qur'an discourses. Therefore, transcreation does not fit to be named translation, but it is supposed to be translated as interpretations. In this case, *tarjamah tafsiriyah* of Muhammad Thalib would be more appropriate to be conceptually called Tafsir Al-Qur'an Muhammad than *tarjamah tafsiriyah*. Secondly, from the practical point of view, this study proves that there is no supreme authority that can claim to be the sole and ultimate authority on the true meaning and ultimate truth of Al-Qur'an as an open text for every translator. Therefore, conventional linguistics should be used in addition to practicing tolerance, logic, and interfaith dialogue.

6. Conclusion

The present study shows that the Quranic translation as a religious sacred text contains transcreation. As long as the translation text involves humans, transcreation will occur. Transcreation has been formed according to the ideological background and the condition of the social culture of the translators. Consequently, translation texts can contain any ideologies based on the inclinations of the translators. Additionally, the result of this study also shows that lexical uses on the words, phrases, and clauses have shown the tendency of efforts to construct a discourse on upholding Islamic law, a discourse on the exclusivity of Islam, and a discourse on religious and democratic relations. The constructed discourses are caused by situational, institutional, and social factors. In the end, this study is expected to be a catalyst to educate on the importance of tolerance, respect, and dialogue among religious communities because of differences in translations. Despite the findings shared by this study, some limitations may rise since the study focuses on one aspect and ignores others. The study only explores the issue of transcreation in the text of the Al-Qur'an translation of Muhammad Thalib and uses a critical discourse analysis approach, and does not examine other translated

texts. Therefore, it is expected that this transcreation research can be further examined using different approaches, such as the Systemic Functional Linguistics (SFL) and corpus analysis. Besides, further research is encouraged to employ different data sources, such as the translation of the Al-Qur'an Quraish Shibab and the translation of the Al-Quran across languages.

References

- Abdul-Raof, H. (2005). Cultural aspects in Qur'an translation. *Translation and religion: Holy untranslatable*, 162-172.
- Abuisaac, S. R., Zaidan, A. M., Alshater, M. M., & Bin Sapar, A. A. (2021). Emotiveness and translational equivalence of irony interface with other figures of speech in the Quranic discourse. *Journal of Intercultural Communication Research*, 50(2), 146-165.
- Abuisaac, S., Albasha, J., Ghaith, M., & Bin Sapar, A. (2023). Barriers of intercultural communication in transferring culturally-bound utterances and expressions of the Qur'an from Arabic into English: Implications and strategy. *Journal of Intercultural Communication Research*, 52(1), 1-24.
- Al-Khatib, A. (2018). Lost in translation: The ideological effects of the translator and the interpreter on the Qur'ānic text. *Aligarh Journal of Quranic Studies*, 1(1), 1-21.
- Al-Khuli, A. (1961). *Manâhij tajdîd fi nahw wa al-balâghah wa al-tafsîr wa al-adab*. Cairo: Dâr al-Ma'ârif.
- Al-Omar, N. (2020). Ideology in advertising: Some implications for transcreation into Arabic. *Hikma*, 19(1), 43-68.
- Al-Tabarî, M. (2000). *Jâmi' al-bayân fi ta'wîl al-Qur'ân*. al-Qāhirah: Muassasah ar-Risālah.
- As-Samarqandî, A. (n.d.). *Bahr al-'ulûm*. Beirut: Dâr al-Fikr.
- Bayri, F. (2019). Li-qawmin yatafakkarûn (Q. 30: 21): Muhammad Asad's Qur'anic translatorial habitus. *Journal of Qur'anic Studies*, 21(2), 1-38.
- Benetello, C. (2018). When translation is not enough: Transcreation as a convention-defying practice. A practitioner's perspective. *The Journal of Specialised Translation*, 29, 28–43. <https://www.jostrans.org/>
- Bernal-Merino, M. Á. (2014). *Translation and localisation in video games*. Routledge. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9781315752334>.
- Gaballo, V. (2012). Exploring the boundaries of transcreation in specialized translation. *ESP Across Cultures*, 9(1), 95-113.
- Gambier, Y. (2016). Translations rapid and radical changes in translation and translation studies. *International Journal of Communication*, 10 (20), 887-906.
- Gaspari, F., Almaghout, H., & Doherty, S. (2015). A survey of machine translation competences: Insights for translation technology educators and practitioners. *Perspectives*, 23(3), 333-358.
- Gunawan, F. (2019). The effect of translation technique to its quality at the Holy Book of Indonesian moslem society. *Lisan: Jurnal Bahasa dan Linguistik*, 8(2), 101-109.
- Gunawan, F., Syukri, H., & Burdah, I. (2022). Revisiting interpretive translation method: A case study of Muhammad Thalib's Quranic translation. *Jordan Journal of Modern Languages and Literatures*, 14(1), 111-127.
- Gunawan, F. (2022). The ideology of translators in Quranic translation: Lessons learned from Indonesia. *Cogent Arts & Humanities*, 9(1), 2088438.

- Haroun, Y. (2022). When women and men collaborate to translate the Qur'an: An 'interactive' approach. *Parallèles*, 34(1), 180-192.
- Katan, D. (2016). Translation at the cross-roads: Time for the transcreational turn?. *Perspectives*, 34(3), 365-381. <https://doi.org/10.1080/0907676X.2015.1016049>
- Katan, D. (2019). Translating or transcreating: In theory and in practice, and by whom. In C. Spinzi, A. Rizzo, & M. L. Zummo (Eds.), *Translation or transcreation: Discourse, Texts and visuals* (pp. 15-38). Cambridge Scholars Publishing.
- Kašīr, A. (1999). *Tafsīr al-Qur'ān al-'azhīm*. Beirut: Dār At-Thib.
- Kermani, N. (2004). From revelation to interpretation: Nasr Hamid Abu Zayd and the literary study of the Qur'an'. *Modern Muslim intellectuals and the Qur'an*, 169-192.
- Khosravi, H., & Pourmohammadi, M. (2016). Influence of translator's religious ideology on translation: A case study of English translations of the noble Quran. *International Journal of English Language & Translation Studies*, 4(4), 151-163.
- Kwiatk, E. (2020). Translation or transcreation? Ghost stories in Charles Causley's poems for children. In *Negotiating translation and transcreation of children's literature* (pp. 209-225). Springer, Singapore.
- Manzūr, I. (1955). *Lisān al-A'rab*. al-Qāhirah: Dār al-Ma'ārif.
- Mavis Ho, N. K. (2020). Transcreation in marketing: A corpus-based study of persuasion in optional shifts from English to Chinese. *Perspectives*, 1-13. [10.1080/0907676X.2020.1778046](https://doi.org/10.1080/0907676X.2020.1778046).
- Mohamed, E. (2017). Ara 'aytum: The Exegetical Implications of a Qur'ānic Stance Marker. *Al-Bayan: Journal of Qur'an and Hadith Studies*, 15(2), 170-192.
- Munday, J., & Gambier, Y. (2014). A conversation between Yves Gambier and Jeremy Munday about transcreation and the future of the professions. *Cultus: the Intercultural Journal of Mediation and Communication*, 7, 20-36.
- O'Hagan, M. (2012). Transcreating Japanese video games: Exploring a future direction for translation studies in Japan. *Translation and translation studies in the Japanese context*, 183-201.
- O'Hagan, M., & Chandler, H. (2016). Game localization research and translation studies. *Border crossings: Translation studies and other disciplines*, 126, 309.
- Pedersen, D. (2017). Managing transcreation projects: An ethnographic study. *Translation Spaces*, 6(1), 44-61.
- Qassem, M. (2021). Translations of stylistic variations in the Noble Qur'an into English: stylistic and exegetical perspectives. *Journal of Intercultural Communication Research*, 50(3), 304-322.
- Rike, S. M. (2013). Bilingual corporate websites-from translation to transcreation? *The Journal of Specialised Translation*, 20, 68-85. <https://www.jostrans.org/>
- Risku, H., Pichler, T., & Wieser, V. (2017). Transcreation as a translation service: Process requirements and client expectations. *Across Languages and Cultures*, 18(1), 53-77.
- Rodríguez, C. C., Olvera-Lobo, M. D., & Moya-Molina, E. (2020). Cultural elements in Spanish SME websites and social media: From localization to transcreation?. In *Challenges and opportunities for SMEs in industry 4.0* (pp. 155-181). IGI Global.
- Shihab, M. Q. (2005). *Tafsir Al-Misbah: Pesan, kesan, dan keserasian al-Qur'an (Tafsir Al-Misbah: Message, impression, and Harmony of the Qur'an)*. Vol 2. Lentera Hati.
- Šiaučiūnė, V., & Liubinienė, V. (2011). Video game localization: The analysis of in-game texts. *Studies About Languages*, (19).

- Spinzi, C., & Rizzo, A. (Eds.). (2019). *Translation or Transcreation? Discourses, texts and visuals*. Cambridge Scholars Publishing.
- Sunendar, et al. (2015). *Kamus Besar Bahasa Indonesia (KBBI) Edisi V* [Big Indonesian Dictionary, 4th Edition]. PT. Gramedia Utama.
- Thalib, M. (2012). *Al-Qur'anul Karim Tarjamah Tafsiriyah: Memahami makna Al-Qur'an lebih mudah, cepat, dan tepat (Al-Qur'anul Karim Tarjamah Tafsiriyah: Understanding meanings of the Qur'an easier, faster, and more appropriate)*. Qolam Mas.
- van der Deijl, L. (2022). Orientalist Ambivalence: Translating the Qur'an in the Dutch Republic. *Early Modern Low Countries*, 6(2), 176-200.